Agenda Item 11



Report to Policy Committee

Author/Lead Officer of Report: (Sabia Hanif-Interim Parking Services Manager, Operational Services)

	Services)				
	Tel: 07900 655289				
Report of:	Ajman Ali, Operational Services				
Report to:	Waste and Streetscene				
Date of Decision:	15.02.23				
Subject:	Fees & Charges – Electric Vehicle charging units				
Has an Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) been undertaken? Yes x No If YES, what EIA reference number has it been given? 121 Clean Air Strategy & Ref xx					
EV fees and Charges Has appropriate consultation take	en place? Yes No x				
Has a Climate Impact Assessment (CIA) been undertaken? Yes x No					
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information? Yes No x					
If YES, give details as to whether the exemption applies to the full report / part of the report and/or appendices and complete below:-					
"The (report/appendix) is not for publication because it contains exempt information under Paragraph (insert relevant paragraph number) of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 (as amended)."					
Purpose of Report:					
This report seeks approval to increase the current tariff price to be charged to motorists using Sheffield City Council's Rapid Electric Vehicle Chargers. It also seeks approval of the price to be charged to motorists using Sheffield City Council's new Fast Electric Vehicle Chargers.					

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Waste and Streetscene Committee:

- i. Approve the price charged to motorists using the Council's existing network of Rapid (50kW) Electric Vehicle Chargers being increased to 72p per kilowatt hour used for the first 60 minutes with the charge after 60 minutes increasing to a flat fee of £20 per hour to encourage turnover and access to the chargers.
- ii. Approve the price charged to motorists using the Council's new network of Fast (7kW – 22kW) Electric Vehicle Chargers being initially set at 58p per Kilowatt hour.
- iii. Note that a new Traffic Regulation Order to implement the fees for Fast Chargers is intended to be proposed. This proposal will be subject to the usual statutory consultation process required for a Traffic Regulation Order.
- iv. Note that a new Traffic Regulation Order to implement pay and display parking charges for vehicles that are in parking places and charging via Fast Electric Vehicle Chargers is intended to be proposed. This proposal will also be subject to the usual statutory consultation process required for a Traffic Regulation Order.
- v. Delegate Authority to the Executive Director of Operational Services, in consultation with the Chair, Deputy Chair and Group Spokesperson for the Waste and Streetscene Committee, to make future changes to the fee motorists pay to use the Council's electric charging infrastructure, where:
 - a. the change supports effective management of demand for parking and contributes to wider traffic management objectives;
 - b. the proposed change is not for an amount greater or less than the rate of 15p per Kilowatt hour or the Retail Price Index plus 1% from the date they were last increased, whichever is greater.

Background Papers:

<u>Sheffield City Council - Agenda for Transport, Regeneration and Climate Policy</u> Committee on Wednesday 21 September 2022, 2.00 pm

Lea	Lead Officer to complete:-				
1	I have consulted the relevant departments in respect of any relevant implications indicated on the Statutory and Council Policy Checklist, and comments have been incorporated / additional forms completed / EIA completed, where required.	Finance: James Lyon			
		Legal: <i>Richard Cannon</i>			
		Equalities & Consultation: Louise Nunn			
		Climate: Jess Rick			
	Legal, financial/commercial and equalities implications must be included within the report and the name of the officer consulted must be included above.				
2	SLB member who approved submission:	Ajman Ali			
3	Committee Chair consulted:	Joe Otten, Waste and streetscene			
4	I confirm that all necessary approval has been obtained in respect of the implications indicated on the Statutory and Council Policy Checklist and that the report has been approved for submission to the Committee by the SLB member indicated at 2. In addition, any additional forms have been completed and signed off as required at 1.				
	Lead Officer Name: Sabia Hanif	Job Title: Interim Parking Services Manager			
	Date: 09.01.23				

1. Proposal

- 1.1 Sheffield City Council previously received funding for Rapid (50kW) EV Chargers from the Early Measures Fund, the Government's Joint Air Quality Unit, National Highways and the Ultra-Low Emission Taxi Infrastructure Scheme from the Office of Low Emission Vehicles.
- The Electrical Vehicle infrastructure was implemented in March 2021 to provide motorist opportunities to charge their electric vehicles. The current chargers enable a fully electric vehicle to charge to approximately 80% of its battery capacity in 30 to 40 minutes (depending on the vehicle model). Of the 27 chargers installed, 10 charging points are assigned to Hackney carriage taxis and private hire vehicles. The remaining 17 are for the public as well as taxi and private hire drivers.
- 1.3 These chargers were installed to support the role of Ultra Low Emission Vehicles (ULEV) and ULEV Taxis in Sheffield. Lack of charging infrastructure has been one of the barriers to owning and operating an electric vehicle
- 1.4 The price currently charged to motorists is set at 30 pence per Kilowatt Hour used. This price increases to £10 per hour used after 60 minutes of charging. This is to discourage motorists using the bays to park once their vehicle has had enough charge to fill the battery. As an 80% charge can be reached in approximately 30-40 minutes (depending on the vehicle model), this encourages turnover of space and increases availability of charging units for other motorists.
- 1.5 There are no additional parking fees applied to use the bays designated for the Rapid EV Chargers. The only cost for motorists to pay is based on the amount of electricity used. Since 1st of April 2022 there has been a significant increase in energy costs by approximately 118% which means Sheffield City Council is now making a loss on each charging session. The council's current tariff is the cheapest in the market and utilisation has increased by 170% from April to December 2022.
- 1.6 Due to the significant hike in energy costs, and the likelihood of these increases continuing, it has meant that the current tariffs are not financially sustainable. The strategic rationale for the council to install and operate electric vehicle charging units is to support access to essential infrastructure, which has been identified as a barrier to transferring to lower emission electric vehicles, rather than to subsidise the cost of operating an electric vehicle.
- 1.7 In March 2022 Co-operative Executive approved the use of £482,337 of Get Britain Building funding via the SYMCA [South Yorkshire Mayoral Combined Authority] for the installation of electric vehicle charger points at various locations across Sheffield. Using the framework contract procured by BMBC, Sheffield City Council have approved the purchase

- and install of up to another 46 Fast (7kW) Chargers and 2 Rapid (50kW) Chargers at 10 locations during 2022/2023.
- 1.8 Fast (7KW) chargers need around 4 hours for a vehicle to reach 80% capacity (dependent on the vehicle model), compared with 30-40 minutes for a Rapid EV Chargers, so their use will be different. It is expected that vehicles will be plugged in longer than an hour to have their battery fully charged, so therefore the tariff will need to be different from the Rapid EV Chargers.
- 1.9 The electric vehicle charging bays for Rapid EV Chargers are covered by an existing Traffic Regulation Order which imposes a charge this is the charge which it is recommended should be increased. For the Fast EV Chargers, no charge currently applies and a new Traffic Regulation Order will be required so as to implement the charges in the first instance. The order, if proposed, will be subject to the standard statutory process, which includes consultation. No decision is being sought in respect of a TRO at this stage. Instead, members are recommended only to approve the charge amount.
- 1.10 The investment made in electric chargers begins to address some of the city's need, but projections show that the city requires more charging infrastructure than it already has.
- 1.11 It is therefore essential the infrastructure is financially sustainable to ensure that the initial allocation can operate effectively now, but also be maintained or even replaced in future years.
- 1.12 Sheffield City Council is only one of several operators of electric vehicle chargers in the city. Motorists will have a choice of which provider to use. To ensure that the council's chargers are sustainable, while not discouraging use, the Council has undertaken benchmarking with local authority and commercial operators in price setting.
- 1.13 Additional on-costs have also been factored into the pricing, ensuring overheads associated with maintaining, operating, and replacing chargers are covered in the fee. Any surplus income generated once the overheads have been settled will be accounted for in line with legislation for other local authority parking fees, in that they must be used for
 - Provision and maintenance of off-street parking
 - Meeting costs incurred in the provision or operation of public transport
 - Highway and road improvements and maintenance
 - Reducing environmental pollution
 - Improving public open spaces.
- 1.14 The price charged to motorists for Rapid EV Chargers is recommended to increase to 72 pence per Kilowatt Hour used. The overstay charge is recommended to increase to £20 per hour used after 60 minutes of charging. This is to discourage motorists using the bays to park once their

- vehicle has had enough charge to fill the battery. As an 80% charge can be reached in approximately 40 minutes (depending on the vehicle model), this encourages turnover of space and increases availability of charging units for other motorists.
- 1.15 Motorists using the Rapid EV Charger infrastructure will continue to be exempt from parking pay and display charges. The rational for not charging for parking at Rapid points is to support the business use of taxis and vans where the market is less mature (as well as those that are unable to charge at home or during other business) as they are more likely to need quick, short stop to top up (rather than longer stay parking). To encourage the turn-over of users at these facilities to allow for increased capacity.
- 1.16 For Fast EV Chargers the fee is recommended to initially be set at 58 pence per kilowatt hour. A table of priced used to benchmark this price against can be found at appendix A
- 1.17 Sheffield City Council is one of the last few LA's that currently provides free parking provision to motorists that own electric vehicles and are using fast chargers. Motorists using Fast EV Chargers will be parking for a longer stay, which can average around 4 hours (depending on the vehicle type). Due to the hike in energy costs, the Council is no longer able to continue to provide this provision for free otherwise it would mean the Council would have to increase the tariffs in other spaces further to reflect the loss of revenue. This would make the Council the most expensive provider. The implementation of pay and display parking charges for vehicles that are in parking places and charging via Fast Electric Vehicle Chargers is intended to be implemented by way of a new Traffic Regulation Order.
- 1.18 The aforementioned order, if proposed, will be subject to the standard statutory process, which includes consultation. No decision is being sought in respect of a TRO to implement these pay and display charges at this stage. It is considered likely that the Council will include both the new Fast EV Charger fees and the pay and display fees within the same TRO proposal such that both can be subject of the same statutory consultation at the same time.
- 1.19 A TRO allows the Council to undertake enforcement action against motorists that park in Electric vehicle bays that are not actively charging or do not adhere to conditions of use.
- 1.20 No pay and display charges are currently being proposed for Rapid EV Charger points. By allowing the continued 'free' parking at these points, the Council would still be supporting businesses looking to invest in for example LGVs and taxis.
- 1.21 There is an expectation that there will be further opportunities to expand the charging infrastructure in the coming years. This proposal therefore is to increase the Rapid (50kW) charger tariffs and to set the initial price

charged for the 46 new Fast (7kW) EV Chargers, but the principles of this decision are expected to apply to new infrastructure too.

2. HOW DOES THIS DECISION CONTRIBUTE?

- 2.1 The Council has declared a climate emergency which necessitates a move away from the use of traditional fossil fuels, to cleaner technologies such as electric. SCC is working towards Sheffield becoming a zero-carbon city by the end of the next decade.
- 2.2 This report supports the initial strategic priority of the developing Corporate Plan of Clean Economic Growth. Delivering on the key issue of the Climate Emergency and supporting the Clean Air Zone. The 10 Point Plan for Climate Action includes that the Council will work to ensure it has the planning and infrastructure needed for the future, including investing in our transport infrastructure.
- 2.3 The Sheffield City Region Transport Strategy 2018-2040 (the statutory Local Transport Plan for South Yorkshire) recognises the need to increase EV charging points in the region to encourage large scale uptake of electric vehicles.
- 2.4 The lack of infrastructure to charge electric vehicles rapidly is seen as a barrier to switching from a combustion engine to an ultra-low emission vehicle. Improving the availability of chargers will contribute towards motorists' consideration of changing vehicles and in turn the potential to improve air quality in Sheffield.

3. HAS THERE BEEN ANY CONSULTATION?

- 3.1 Consultation undertaken in 2018 on the City's Clean Air ambitions showed that 55% of citizen respondents wanted the council to do more to support ultra-low emission vehicles. That figure rose to 56% for businesses consulted. However only 36% of taxi drivers wanted more to be done to support ultra-low emission vehicles. https://www.sheffield.gov.uk/home/pollution-nuisance/clean-air-zone
- 3.2 For existing Rapid EV Chargers, the Council is not required to consult on straightforward changes to prices (and only prices) included within a tariff, but a legal notice will be published in the local newspaper giving at least 21 days' notice of the changes being implemented. Copies of the legal notice will also be posted in the car parks covered by the new tariffs.
- In relation to the new Fast EV chargers, this is a 'new' charge which has not previously been implemented in respect of the relevant parking places. Contrast this with the rapid chargers, which are subject to an existing charge which this report simply recommends be increased.
- The Council will need a TRO so as to implement them. There will therefore be a statutory consultation carried out as part of TRO proposal

and prior to it coming into force, should a decision be made to proceed. According to the requirements of the legislation, any objections received during the consultation must be considered before the effect of the TRO may be made permanent. The fee for charging will be subject to the consultation in virtue of its inclusion within the TRO. This consultation is considered sufficient for its purpose.

4. RISK ANALYSIS AND IMPLICATIONS OF THE DECISION

4.1 Equality Implications

- 4.1.1 An Equality Impact Assessment has taken place for the Clean Air Strategy. The charging infrastructure contributes towards the ambitions in this Strategy by supporting an increase in the uptake of ultra-low emission vehicles.
- 4.1.2 The Clean Air Strategy Equality Impact Assessment concluded that the actions are expected to have a positive impact on the health and economic outcomes of everyone in the city. It should have a particularly positive impact the very young and the very old, disabled people and their carers and pregnant women.
- 4.1.3 It is possible that that there may be some financial impacts on people on lower incomes that need to be recognised and mitigated where possible. The Council will work closely with communities who may be affected by these changes to ensure that it supports everyone with the shifts needed to make better air for everyone.

4.2 Financial and Commercial Implications

- 4.2.1 The cost of purchasing the chargers and maintaining their use has been met from government grants for capital infrastructure. Ongoing revenue cost for maintaining the car parking places and other associated overheads from operating the charges has been considered when setting the charge to the motorist.
- 4.2.2 The fee has been set in line with prices available to other motorists both commercially and comparing with other local authorities.
- 4.2.3 Since 1st of April to December 2022 the Council has made a £58k loss on Rapid EV Chargers and the gap between income and expenditure will continue to grow if the Council doesn't increase the current tariff.
- 4.2.4 The energy market remains volatile, and this will continue to remain as a risk.

4.3 Legal Implications

4.3.1 A notice of variation may be made under section 35C or 46A of the Road

Traffic Regulation Act 1984 ('the 1984 Act') and concerns the varying of charges to be paid in connection with the use of on and off-street parking places. The Local Authorities' Traffic Orders (Procedure) (England and Wales) Regulations 1996 ('the 1996 Regulations') provide the procedure that the Council must follow when publishing a notice of variation.

- 4.3.2 Regulation 25 of the 1996 Regulations specify that a notice of variation shall be given by publishing it at least once in a newspaper circulating in the area in which the parking places to which the notice relates are situated at least 21 days before it is due to come into force. If the recommendations of this report are approved, the Council will be required to do this for the Rapid EV Chargers so as to increase the existing fees.
- 4.3.3 As a notice of variation is made using a power under the 1984 Act, the Council must have regard to its duty under section 122 of the 1984 Act to secure the expeditious, convenient and safe movement of vehicular and other traffic (including pedestrians) as well as the provision of suitable and adequate parking facilities on and off the highway, so far as practicable while having regard to the matters specified below:
 - (a) the desirability of securing and maintaining reasonable access to premises;
 - (b) the effect on the amenities of any locality affected and (without prejudice to the generality of this paragraph) the importance of regulating and restricting the use of roads by heavy commercial vehicles, so as to preserve or improve the amenities of the areas through which the roads run;
 - (bb) the strategy prepared under section 80 of the Environment Act 1995 (national air quality strategy)
 - I the importance of facilitating the passage of public service vehicles and of securing the safety and convenience of persons using or desiring to use such vehicles: and
 - (d) any other matters appearing to the Council to be relevant.

The proposal detailed in this report is considered to align with the objectives of the aforementioned duty.

- 4.3.4 Section 55 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 ("the Act") requires that the Local Authority keep an account of their income and expenditure in respect of designated parking places. This includes 'pay and display' income. The ring-fenced account is referred to as the Specialist Parking Account. Section 55(4) of the Act sets out the purposes for which any surplus income in respect of designated parking places can be used. These purposes include:
 - Provision and maintenance of off-street parking
 - Meeting costs incurred in the provision or operation of public transport
 - Highway and road improvements and maintenance
 - Reducing environmental pollution
 - o Improvement and maintenance of public open space

- Provision of outdoor recreational facilities open to the public without charge
- 4.3.5 All these functions are carried out by a combination of the Council's City Futures and Operational Services portfolios, which includes Transport, Traffic and Parking Services and the Highways Maintenance Divisions. Any surplus in income in respect of designated parking places is currently utilised in accordance with Section 55(4) of the Act to underpin the activities of these two service areas.
- 4.3.6 None of the recommendations in this report will constitute approval to proceed with a TRO being proposed. However, it is intended that the Council will proceed with the proposal of TROs needed so as to implement the Fast EV Chargers charges as well as pay and display fees in the relevant parking places. Where said TROs are proposed, the procedure for consultation in relation to Traffic Regulation Orders as set out in Schedule 9 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 and the Local Authorities' Traffic Orders (Procedure)(England and Wales) Regulations 1996 ('the 1996 Regulations') will be followed and proper consideration given to all duly made representations. Where objections are received, a decision to proceed with the making and implementation of the order will be referred to the Transport, Regeneration and Climate Policy Committee.

4.4 Climate Implications

- 4.4.1 Climate Action sets out that we will develop decarbonisation route-maps across 7 key areas. Public Electric Vehicles and Charging will be included within the Decarbonisation Route-map for "The Way We Travel" which will be develop in 22/23. The Pathway to Zero Carbon report (the 'Arup report') highlighted the need for catalysing charging infrastructure and solutions that remove significant barriers to the uptake of EVs, and as such progressing the development of public electric vehicle charging infrastructure will contribute towards our Net Zero ambition.
- 4.4.2 The roll out of electric vehicle charging points across Sheffield should contribute to the development of the green economy, including supporting green jobs and skills.
- 4.4.3 The roll out of public electric vehicle charging points will enable those without access to off street parking to transition to electric vehicles, contributing to a just and fair transition to a low carbon world. There are no significant impact identified apart from the positives ones mentioned above.

4.4 Other Implications

4.4.1 None

5. ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 5.1 Consideration was given to charging for 'parking only' (i.e. without also imposing charges which are based on charging an electric vehicle). It was discounted as the Council wants to encourage drivers to use the infrastructure and move on to increase availability of chargers for other motorists. Similarly, encouraging motorists to park in the bay for an extended period would reduce availability.
- 5.1.2 Consideration has also been given to not installing the Fast EV Chargers. However, the lack of infrastructure to charge electric vehicles is a barrier to switching from a combustion engine to an ultra-low emission vehicle. By doing nothing, the availability of chargers will remain lower, and the rate of change to electric vehicles is likely to also remain lower, reducing the speed in which vehicle change takes place, and reducing the impact in improving Sheffield's air quality.
- 5.1.3 Doing nothing and continuing with the current Rapid EV Charger tariffs would mean the gap between income and expenditure would continue to grow, cause further budget pressures and would be financially unsustainable.

6. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6.1 The price of 72 pence per kilowatt hour is in line with other commercial and local authority operators so will be appropriate to encourage use while covering costs of running the chargers. The increase to a flat fee of £20 per hour after 60 minutes of charging will discourage motorist from leaving their vehicle parked in the bay longer than is needed to fill their battery to an adequate charge. A battery can reach 80% charge within 30-40 minutes.
- The fee introduced for Fast EV Chargers at 58 pence per kilowatt hour is in line with other commercial and Local Authority operators so will be appropriate to encourage use while covering costs of operating the chargers.
- Removing the parking exemptions for pay and display charges for electric vehicle motorists using fast chargers is in line with other commercial and Local Authority operators so will be appropriate to encourage use while covering costs of running the chargers and keeps the tariff lower.
- The price is included within the TRO, and therefore subject to the consultation that begins when it is introduced. Any objections duly received must be considered before any variations made to the TRO.

Appendix A

Benchmarked providers. Prices correct as of November 2022.

Network	Fast	Rapid	Membership
PodPoint	£0.30	£0.40	-
BP Pulse			
Member	£0.44	£0.55	£94.20
Geniepoint	_	£0.57	-
Gridserve	£0.49	£0.65	-
Fastned	-	£0.65	-
BP Pulse			
Registered	£0.57	£0.67	-
ESB Member	£0.59	£0.68	£59.88
BP Pulse			
contactless	£0.57	£0.69	-
ESB	£0.63	£0.73	-
Instavolt	-	£0.75	-
Shell Recharge	£0.55	£0.79	-
MFG	-	£0.79	-
Osprey	_	£0.79	-
Swarco	-	£0.79	-